

Dispersive and subelliptic PDEs  
Centro de Giorgi

# $\Gamma$ -convergence for integral functionals depending on vector fields

Andrea Pinamonti

Joint work with Alberto Maione and Francesco Serra Cassano  
Department of Mathematics, University of Trento

February 12, 2020

# Plan of the talk



## Introduction

Framework

Examples

## Functional setting

Functionals depending on vector fields and examples

Sobolev spaces depending on vector fields

$\Gamma$ -convergence

## Results

$H$ -convergence

We assume that  $X_1, \dots, X_m$  are locally Lipschitz continuous vector fields on an open set  $\Omega \subset \mathbb{R}^n$ , i.e.,  $X_j = (c_{j1}, \dots, c_{jn})$ , with  $c_{ji} \in Lip_{loc}(\Omega)$  for  $j = 1, \dots, m, i = 1, \dots, n$ . We identify

$$X_j = \sum_{i=1}^n c_{ji}(x) \partial_i.$$

Moreover, we define the  $X$ -gradient

$$X := (X_1, \dots, X_m)$$

and the *coefficient matrix of the  $X$ -gradient* as the  $m \times n$  matrix

$$C(x) = [c_{ji}(x)]_{\substack{j=1, \dots, m \\ i=1, \dots, n}}.$$

## Definition - Linear Independence Condition

We say that  $X = (X_1, \dots, X_m)$  satisfies the *linear independence condition* (LIC) on an open set  $\Omega \subset \mathbb{R}^n$ , if there exists a set  $\mathcal{N}_X \subset \Omega$ , closed in the topology of  $\Omega$ , such that  $\mathcal{L}^n(\mathcal{N}_X) = 0$  and, for each  $x \in \Omega_X := \Omega \setminus \mathcal{N}_X$ ,  $X_1(x), \dots, X_m(x)$  are linearly independent as vectors of  $\mathbb{R}^n$ .

## Definition - Linear Independence Condition

We say that  $X = (X_1, \dots, X_m)$  satisfies the *linear independence condition* (LIC) on an open set  $\Omega \subset \mathbb{R}^n$ , if there exists a set  $\mathcal{N}_X \subset \Omega$ , closed in the topology of  $\Omega$ , such that  $\mathcal{L}^n(\mathcal{N}_X) = 0$  and, for each  $x \in \Omega_X := \Omega \setminus \mathcal{N}_X$ ,  $X_1(x), \dots, X_m(x)$  are linearly independent as vectors of  $\mathbb{R}^n$ .

**Rmk.** Notice that if  $X = (X_1, \dots, X_m)$  satisfies (LIC), then  $m \leq n$ .

# Examples of relevant vector fields satisfying LIC



(i) (Euclidean gradient) Let  $X = (X_1, \dots, X_n) = (\partial_{x_1}, \dots, \partial_{x_n})$ .

**Rmk.**  $\mathcal{N}_X = \emptyset$  and  $m = n$ .

# Examples of relevant vector fields satisfying LIC



4

(i) (Euclidean gradient) Let  $X = (X_1, \dots, X_n) = (\partial_{x_1}, \dots, \partial_{x_n})$ .

**Rmk.**  $\mathcal{N}_X = \emptyset$  and  $m = n$ .

(ii) (Grushin) Let  $X = (X_1, X_2)$  be the vector fields on  $\mathbb{R}^2$  defined as:

$$X_1(x) := \partial_{x_1}, \quad X_2(x) := x_1 \partial_{x_2} \text{ if } x = (x_1, x_2) \in \mathbb{R}^2.$$

**Rmk.**  $\mathcal{N}_X = \{(x_1, x_2) \in \mathbb{R}^2 \mid x_1 = 0\}$  and  $m = n$ .

# Examples of relevant vector fields satisfying LIC



(i) (Euclidean gradient) Let  $X = (X_1, \dots, X_n) = (\partial_{x_1}, \dots, \partial_{x_n})$ .

**Rmk.**  $\mathcal{N}_X = \emptyset$  and  $m = n$ .

(ii) (Grushin) Let  $X = (X_1, X_2)$  be the vector fields on  $\mathbb{R}^2$  defined as:

$$X_1(x) := \partial_{x_1}, \quad X_2(x) := x_1 \partial_{x_2} \text{ if } x = (x_1, x_2) \in \mathbb{R}^2.$$

**Rmk.**  $\mathcal{N}_X = \{(x_1, x_2) \in \mathbb{R}^2 \mid x_1 = 0\}$  and  $m = n$ .

(iii) (Heisenberg) Let  $X = (X_1, X_2)$  be the vector fields on  $\mathbb{R}^3$  defined as:

$$X_1(x) := \partial_{x_1} - \frac{x_2}{2} \partial_{x_3}, \quad X_2(x) := \partial_{x_2} + \frac{x_1}{2} \partial_{x_3} \text{ if } x = (x_1, x_2, x_3) \in \mathbb{R}^3.$$

**Rmk.**  $\mathcal{N}_X = \emptyset$  and  $m < n$ .



# Examples of relevant vector fields satisfying LIC



4

(i) (Euclidean gradient) Let  $X = (X_1, \dots, X_n) = (\partial_{x_1}, \dots, \partial_{x_n})$ .

**Rmk.**  $\mathcal{N}_X = \emptyset$  and  $m = n$ .

(ii) (Grushin) Let  $X = (X_1, X_2)$  be the vector fields on  $\mathbb{R}^2$  defined as:

$$X_1(x) := \partial_{x_1}, \quad X_2(x) := x_1 \partial_{x_2} \text{ if } x = (x_1, x_2) \in \mathbb{R}^2.$$

**Rmk.**  $\mathcal{N}_X = \{(x_1, x_2) \in \mathbb{R}^2 \mid x_1 = 0\}$  and  $m = n$ .

(iii) (Heisenberg) Let  $X = (X_1, X_2)$  be the vector fields on  $\mathbb{R}^3$  defined as:

$$X_1(x) := \partial_{x_1} - \frac{x_2}{2} \partial_{x_3}, \quad X_2(x) := \partial_{x_2} + \frac{x_1}{2} \partial_{x_3} \text{ if } x = (x_1, x_2, x_3) \in \mathbb{R}^3.$$

**Rmk.**  $\mathcal{N}_X = \emptyset$  and  $m < n$ .

(iv) (Vector Fields not satisfying the Hörmander condition) Let  $X = (X_1, X_2)$  be the vector fields on  $\mathbb{R}^3$  defined as:

$$X_1(x) := \partial_{x_1}, \quad X_2(x) := \partial_{x_2} \text{ if } x = (x_1, x_2, x_3) \in \mathbb{R}^3.$$

**Rmk.**  $\mathcal{N}_X = \emptyset$ ,  $m < n$ .

We will deal with integral functionals  $F : L^p(\Omega) \rightarrow [0, \infty]$ ,  $1 < p < \infty$ , of the form

$$F(u) := \begin{cases} \int_{\Omega} f(x, Xu(x)) dx & \text{if } u \in C^1(\Omega) \\ +\infty & \text{if } u \in L^p(\Omega) \setminus C^1(\Omega) \end{cases},$$

with *integrand function*  $f : \Omega \times \mathbb{R}^m \rightarrow [0, \infty]$  in the class  $I_{m,p}(\Omega, c_0, c_1, a_0, a_1)$ , composed by Borel functions verifying the following assumptions:

- ( $I_1$ ) for a.e.  $x \in \Omega$ , the function  $f(x, \cdot) : \mathbb{R}^m \rightarrow [0, \infty)$  is convex;
- ( $I_2$ ) there exists constants  $c_1 > c_0 \geq 0$  and two nonnegative functions  $a_0, a_1 \in L^1(\Omega)$  such that

$$c_0 |\eta|^p - a_0(x) \leq f(x, \eta) \leq c_1 |\eta|^p + a_1(x),$$

for a.e.  $x \in \Omega$  and for each  $\eta \in \mathbb{R}^m$ .

# Functionals depending on vector fields



5

We will deal with integral functionals  $F : L^p(\Omega) \rightarrow [0, \infty]$ ,  $1 < p < \infty$ , of the form

$$F(u) := \begin{cases} \int_{\Omega} f(x, Xu(x)) dx & \text{if } u \in C^1(\Omega) \\ +\infty & \text{if } u \in L^p(\Omega) \setminus C^1(\Omega) \end{cases},$$

with *integrand function*  $f : \Omega \times \mathbb{R}^m \rightarrow [0, \infty]$  in the class  $I_{m,p}(\Omega, c_0, c_1, a_0, a_1)$ , composed by Borel functions verifying the following assumptions:

- ( $I_1$ ) for a.e.  $x \in \Omega$ , the function  $f(x, \cdot) : \mathbb{R}^m \rightarrow [0, \infty)$  is convex;
- ( $I_2$ ) there exists constants  $c_1 > c_0 \geq 0$  and two nonnegative functions  $a_0, a_1 \in L^1(\Omega)$  such that

$$c_0 |\eta|^p - a_0(x) \leq f(x, \eta) \leq c_1 |\eta|^p + a_1(x),$$

for a.e.  $x \in \Omega$  and for each  $\eta \in \mathbb{R}^m$ .

**Rmk.** We will denote  $I_{m,p}(\Omega, c_0, c_1) = I_{m,p}(\Omega, c_0, c_1, 0, 0)$ .

# Functionals depending on vector fields



6

Let  $f \in I_{m,p}(\Omega, c_0, c_1, a_0, a_1)$  and  $u \in C^1(\Omega)$ . One can write

$$F(u) = \int_{\Omega} f(x, Xu(x)) dx = \int_{\Omega} f_e(x, Du(x)) dx,$$

where  $D = (\partial_{x_1}, \dots, \partial_{x_n})$  and

$$f_e(x, \xi) := f(x, C(x)\xi) \text{ if } \xi \in \mathbb{R}^n$$

will be called **Euclidean integrand associated to  $F$** .

# Functionals depending on vector fields



6

Let  $f \in I_{m,p}(\Omega, c_0, c_1, a_0, a_1)$  and  $u \in C^1(\Omega)$ . One can write

$$F(u) = \int_{\Omega} f(x, Xu(x)) dx = \int_{\Omega} f_e(x, Du(x)) dx,$$

where  $D = (\partial_{x_1}, \dots, \partial_{x_n})$  and

$$f_e(x, \xi) := f(x, C(x)\xi) \text{ if } \xi \in \mathbb{R}^n$$

will be called **Euclidean integrand associated to  $F$** .

**Rmk.** One can prove that the opposite representation may not hold.

**Rmk.** We proved that the opposite representation holds if and only

$$f_e(x, \xi) = f_e(x, \Pi_x(\xi)) \quad \text{for a.e. } x \in \Omega, \forall \xi \in \mathbb{R}^n,$$

where  $\{V_x : x \in \Omega_X\}$  is the distribution of  $m$ -planes in  $\mathbb{R}^n$   
 $V_x = \text{span}_{\mathbb{R}} \{X_1(x), \dots, X_m(x)\}$  and  $\Pi_x : \mathbb{R}^n \rightarrow V_x$  denotes the projection of  $\mathbb{R}^n$  on  $V_x$ . Let  $X$  be the Heisenberg vector fields in  $\mathbb{R}^3$ , let  $\Omega \subset \mathbb{R}^3$  be a bounded open set containing the origin and  $p = 2$ . Let  $F : L^2(\Omega) \times \Omega \rightarrow [0, \infty]$  be the local functional defined as

$$F(u) := \begin{cases} \int_{\Omega} |Du|^2 dx & \text{if } u \in W^{1,2}(\Omega) \\ \infty & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}.$$

If there is some integrand  $f : \Omega \times \mathbb{R}^2 \rightarrow [0, \infty]$  for which the representation holds then,

$$|\xi|^2 = f_e(x, \xi) = f_e(x, \Pi_x(\xi)) = |\Pi_x(\xi)|^2$$

for a.e.  $x \in \Omega, \forall \xi \in \mathbb{R}^3$ .

Since the function  $\Omega \ni x \mapsto \Pi_x(\xi)$  is continuous, the previous identity must hold for each  $x \in \Omega$  and  $\xi \in \mathbb{R}^3$ . Let  $x = 0$ , then a simple calculation yields that  $\Pi_0(\xi) = (\xi_1, \xi_2, 0)$  for each  $\xi = (\xi_1, \xi_2, \xi_3) \in \mathbb{R}^3$ . Thus, if we choose  $\xi = (0, 0, 1)$ , the previous identity is not satisfied and then we have a contradiction.

# Examples of functionals depending on vector fields



Let  $f(x, \eta) = |\eta|^2$  and let  $u \in C^1(\Omega)$ . Then

(i) **(Grushin)**

$$F(u) = \int_{\Omega} f(x, Xu) dx = \int_{\Omega} \left( \partial_{x_1} u^2 + x_1^2 \partial_{x_2} u^2 \right) dx.$$

(ii) **(Heisenberg)**

$$F(u) = \int_{\Omega} f(x, Xu) dx = \int_{\Omega} \left( (\partial_1 u - \frac{x_2}{2} \partial_{x_3} u)^2 + (\partial_{x_2} u + \frac{x_1}{2} \partial_{x_3} u)^2 \right) dx.$$



# Examples of functionals depending on vector fields



Let  $f(x, \eta) = |\eta|^2$  and let  $u \in C^1(\Omega)$ . Then

(i) **(Grushin)**

$$F(u) = \int_{\Omega} f(x, Xu) dx = \int_{\Omega} \left( \partial_{x_1} u^2 + x_1^2 \partial_{x_2} u^2 \right) dx.$$

(ii) **(Heisenberg)**

$$F(u) = \int_{\Omega} f(x, Xu) dx = \int_{\Omega} \left( (\partial_1 u - \frac{x_2}{2} \partial_{x_3} u)^2 + (\partial_{x_2} u + \frac{x_1}{2} \partial_{x_3} u)^2 \right) dx.$$

**Rmk.** Observe that the previous functionals are not coercive w.r.t. the Euclidean gradient, that is, the coercivity condition

$$f_e(x, \xi) \geq c_0 |\xi|^2 \text{ a.e. } x \in \Omega, \forall \xi \in \mathbb{R}^n,$$

for a suitable constant  $c_0 > 0$ , may fail.

For  $1 \leq p \leq \infty$  we set

$$W_X^{1,p}(\Omega) := \{u \in L^p(\Omega) : X_j u \in L^p(\Omega) \text{ for } j = 1, \dots, m\}$$

**Rmk.** It holds:

$$\begin{aligned} W^{1,p}(\Omega) &\subset W_X^{1,p}(\Omega) \quad \forall p \in [1, \infty] \text{ and, for any } u \in W^{1,p}(\Omega), \\ Xu(x) &= C(x) Du(x) \quad \text{for a.e. } x \in \Omega, \end{aligned}$$

where  $W^{1,p}(\Omega)$  denotes the **classical Sobolev space**, or, equivalently, the space  $W_X^{1,p}(\Omega)$  associated to  $X = D := (\partial_{x_1}, \dots, \partial_{x_n})$ . The inclusion can be strict.

Moreover, we will denote by  $W_{X,0}^{1,p}(\Omega)$  the closure of  $C_c^1(\Omega) \cap W_X^{1,p}(\Omega)$  in  $W_X^{1,p}(\Omega)$ .

**G.B. Folland, E.M. Stein**, *Hardy spaces on homogeneous groups*, Princeton University Press, Princeton, 1982

# Quick introduction to $\Gamma$ convergence I



11

The theory of  $\Gamma$ -convergence was introduced in the '70 by E. De Giorgi. Among the precursors of the theory, one should mention:

- ▶ the Mosco convergence (for convex functions and their duals);
- ▶ the G-convergence of Spagnolo for elliptic operators in divergence form.

But, it is only with De Giorgi and with the examples worked out by his school that the theory reached a mature stage.

# Quick introduction to $\Gamma$ convergence II



Let  $(X, d)$  be a metric space,  $F_n : X \rightarrow (-\infty, +\infty)$  lower semicontinuous. As in many other cases, to define convergence we pass through the intermediate notions of upper and lower limits:

$$\Gamma - \limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} F_n(x) := \inf \{ \limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} F_n(x_n) \mid x_n \rightarrow x \}$$

$$\Gamma - \liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} F_n(x) := \inf \{ \liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} F_n(x_n) \mid x_n \rightarrow x \}$$

It is obvious that  $\Gamma - \liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} F_n \leq \Gamma - \limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} F_n$ , and it is not too difficult to check that they are both lower semicontinuous. We say that  $F_n$   $\Gamma$ -converge if

$$\Gamma - \liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} F_n \geq \Gamma - \limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} F_n$$

and we denote the common value of the upper and lower  $\Gamma$  limits by  $\Gamma - \lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} F_n$ .

# Quick introduction to $\Gamma$ convergence III



As soon as we have a guess  $F$  for the  $\Gamma$ -limit, we have to prove that

$$\Gamma - \limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} F_n \leq F(x) \quad \text{and} \quad F(x) \leq \Gamma - \liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} F_n.$$

The first inequality means that we should be able to find  $(x_n) \subset X$  convergent to  $x$  with  $\limsup_{n \rightarrow \infty} F_n(x_n) \leq F(x)$ . Any sequence  $(x_n)$  with this property is called recovery sequence. The second inequality means that we should be able to prove, for any  $(x_n) \subset X$  convergent to  $x$ , the lower bound for the  $\liminf$ , namely  $\liminf_{n \rightarrow \infty} F_n(x_n) \geq F(x)$ . In general pointwise convergence has nothing to do with  $\Gamma$ -convergence, for instance  $F_n(x) = \sin(nx)$   $\Gamma$ -converges to  $-1$ . In this case

$$x_n = -\frac{\pi}{2n} + \frac{2[nx/2]\pi}{n} \quad \text{is a recovery sequence.}$$

## Theorem

If  $\Gamma\text{-}\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} F_n = F$  and  $(x_n) \subset X$  is s.t.

$$F_n(x_n) \leq \inf_X F_n + \varepsilon_n$$

with  $\varepsilon_n \rightarrow 0$ , then any limit point  $x$  of  $(x_n)$  minimizes  $F$ . In addition, under the equi-coercivity assumption

$$\inf_X F_n = \inf_K F_n \quad \text{for some compact set } K \subset X \text{ independent of } n,$$

one has that  $F_n$  attain their minimum value, and

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \min_X F_n = \min_X F.$$

# A $\Gamma$ -compactness problem

Let  $X = (X_1, \dots, X_m)$  be a given family of locally Lipschitz vector fields on a bounded open set  $\Omega \subset \mathbb{R}^n$ , let  $(f_h)_h \subset I_{m,p}(\Omega, c_0, c_1, a_0, a_1)$  and let  $F_h : L^p(\Omega) \rightarrow [0, \infty]$  be defined as

$$F_h(u) := \begin{cases} \int_{\Omega} f_h(x, Xu(x)) dx & \text{if } u \in W_X^{1,p}(\Omega) \\ +\infty & \text{if } u \in L^p(\Omega) \setminus W_X^{1,p}(\Omega) \end{cases} .$$

## Question

Are there a function  $f \in I_{m,p}(\Omega, c_0, c_1, a_0, a_1)$  and a functional  $F : L^p(\Omega) \rightarrow [0, \infty]$  such that, up to a subsequence,

- ▶  $F = \Gamma(L^p(\Omega)) - \lim_{h \rightarrow \infty} F_h$ ,
- ▶  $F(u) = \int_{\Omega} f(x, Xu(x)) dx$  for each  $u \in W_X^{1,p}(\Omega)$ ?

Moreover, how can we characterize

$$\text{dom } F := \{u \in L^p(\Omega) : F(u) < \infty\} ?$$

# The starting point

Assume that  $f_h = f \in I_{m,p}(\Omega, c_0, c_1, a_0, a_1)$  for each  $h \in \mathbb{N}$ . Then, it is well-known that

$$\left( \Gamma(L^p(\Omega)) - \lim_{h \rightarrow \infty} F_h \right) (u) = \bar{F}(u),$$

where

$$\bar{F}(u) := \inf \left\{ \liminf_{h \rightarrow \infty} F(u_h) : (u_h)_h \subset L^p(\Omega), u_h \rightarrow u \text{ in } L^p(\Omega) \right\}.$$

is the **relaxed functional of  $F$** , w.r.t. the  $L^p$ -topology.



# The starting point

Assume that  $f_h = f \in L_{m,p}(\Omega, \mathbf{c}_0, \mathbf{c}_1, \mathbf{a}_0, \mathbf{a}_1)$  for each  $h \in \mathbb{N}$ . Then, it is well-known that

$$\left( \Gamma(L^p(\Omega)) - \lim_{h \rightarrow \infty} F_h \right) (u) = \bar{F}(u),$$

where

$$\bar{F}(u) := \inf \left\{ \liminf_{h \rightarrow \infty} F(u_h) : (u_h)_h \subset L^p(\Omega), u_h \rightarrow u \text{ in } L^p(\Omega) \right\}.$$

is the relaxed functional of  $F$ , w.r.t. the  $L^p$ -topology.

## Theorem (Franchi-Serapioni-Serra Cassano, 1996)

Let  $X = (X_1, \dots, X_m)$  be a given family of vector fields on a open set  $\Omega \subset \mathbb{R}^n$  and let  $1 < p < \infty$ . Then:

- ▶  $\text{dom } \bar{F} = W_X^{1,p}(\Omega)$  ;
- ▶  $\bar{F}(u) = \int_{\Omega} f(x, Xu(x)) dx$  for every  $u \in W_X^{1,p}(\Omega)$ .

# The $\Gamma$ -compactness result

## Theorem (Maione-P.-Serra Cassano)

Let  $\Omega \subset \mathbb{R}^n$  be a bounded open set and let  $X = (X_1, \dots, X_m)$  satisfy (LIC) on  $\Omega$ . Let  $(f_h)_h \subset I_{m,p}(\Omega, c_0, c_1, a_0, a_1)$  and let  $(F_h)_h$  be the associated sequence of integral functionals on  $L^p(\Omega)$ ,  $1 < p < \infty$ . Then, up to a subsequence, there exist a  $F : L^p(\Omega) \rightarrow [0, \infty]$  and  $f \in I_{m,p}(\Omega, c_0, c_1, a_0, a_1)$  such that

- ▶  $F = \Gamma(L^p(\Omega)) - \lim_{h \rightarrow \infty} F_h$
- ▶ For each  $u \in L^p(\Omega)$

$$\left( \Gamma(L^p(\Omega)) - \lim_{h \rightarrow \infty} F_h \right) (u) = \begin{cases} \int_{\Omega} f(x, Xu(x)) dx & \text{if } u \in W_X^{1,p}(\Omega) \\ \infty & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$$

**A. Maione, A. Pinamonti, F. Serra Cassano**,  $\Gamma$ -convergence for functionals depending on vector fields I. Integral representation and compactness, *Journal de Mathématiques Pures et Appliquées*, (2020)

Proof's strategy consists in two steps.

**1st step.** Let  $\mathcal{A}$  be the class of all open subsets of  $\Omega$  and let  $(F_h)_h$  be a sequence of integral functionals on  $L^p(\Omega) \times \mathcal{A}$ ,  $1 < p < \infty$ , of the form

$$F_h(u, A) := \begin{cases} \int_A f_{h,e}(x, Du(x)) dx & \text{if } A \in \mathcal{A}, u \in W_{\text{loc}}^{1,1}(A) \\ +\infty & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$$

where

$$f_{h,e}(x, \xi) := f_h(x, C(x)\xi) \quad x \in \Omega, \xi \in \mathbb{R}^n.$$

Proof's strategy consists in two steps.

**1st step.** Let  $\mathcal{A}$  be the class of all open subsets of  $\Omega$  and let  $(F_h)_h$  be a sequence of integral functionals on  $L^p(\Omega) \times \mathcal{A}$ ,  $1 < p < \infty$ , of the form

$$F_h(u, A) := \begin{cases} \int_A f_{h,e}(x, Du(x)) dx & \text{if } A \in \mathcal{A}, u \in W_{loc}^{1,1}(A) \\ +\infty & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$$

where

$$f_{h,e}(x, \xi) := f_h(x, C(x)\xi) \quad x \in \Omega, \xi \in \mathbb{R}^n.$$

Then, applying classical results from the **Euclidean setting**, up to a subsequence, there exists  $F : L^p(\Omega) \times \mathcal{A} \rightarrow [0, \infty]$  such that

$$F(\cdot, A) = \left( \Gamma(L^p(\Omega)) - \lim_{h \rightarrow \infty} F_h \right) (\cdot, A) \quad \text{for each } A \in \mathcal{A}. \quad (1)$$

Moreover,  $F$  can be represented by an integral form on  $W^{1,p}(A)$  by means of an **Euclidean integrand function**, that is,

$$F(u, A) := \int_A f_e(x, Du(x)) dx \quad (2)$$

for every  $A \in \mathcal{A}$ , for every  $u \in L^p(\Omega)$  such that  $u|_A \in W^{1,p}(A)$ , and for a suitable Borel function  $f_e : \Omega \times \mathbb{R}^n \rightarrow [0, \infty]$ .

Moreover,  $F$  can be represented by an integral form on  $W^{1,p}(A)$  by means of an **Euclidean integrand function**, that is,

$$F(u, A) := \int_A f_e(x, Du(x)) dx \quad (2)$$

for every  $A \in \mathcal{A}$ , for every  $u \in L^p(\Omega)$  such that  $u|_A \in W^{1,p}(A)$ , and for a suitable Borel function  $f_e : \Omega \times \mathbb{R}^n \rightarrow [0, \infty]$ .

**2nd step.** We prove the following closure property w.r.t. the  $\Gamma$ -convergence: let  $(f_h)_h \subset I_{m,p}(\Omega, c_0, c_1, a_0, a_1)$  such that (1) and (2) hold, then  $F$  can be represented in the following integral form

$$F(u) = \begin{cases} \int_{\Omega} f(x, Xu(x)) dx & \text{if } u \in W_X^{1,p}(\Omega) \\ \infty & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$$

for a suitable function  $f \in I_{m,p}(\Omega, c_0, c_1, a_0, a_1)$ .

# Two interesting compact subclasses of integrands



- ▶ the subclass  $J_1(\Omega, c_0, c_1)$  composed by integrand functions  $f \in L_{m,p}(\Omega, c_0, c_1)$  such that  $f = f(\eta)$ , that is,  $f$  independent of  $x$ .

# Two interesting compact subclasses of integrands



- ▶ the subclass  $J_1(\Omega, c_0, c_1)$  composed by integrand functions  $f \in I_{m,p}(\Omega, c_0, c_1)$  such that  $f = f(\eta)$ , that is,  $f$  independent of  $x$ .
- ▶ the subclass of  $J_2(\Omega, c_0, c_1) := I_{m,2}(\Omega, c_0, c_1)$  composed of integrand functions  $f \in I_{m,2}(\Omega, c_0, c_1)$  which are quadratic forms with respect to  $\eta$ , that is,

$$f(x, \eta) = \langle a(x)\eta, \eta \rangle = \sum_{i,j=1}^m a_{ij}(x)\eta_i\eta_j \quad \text{a.e. } x \in \Omega, \forall \eta \in \mathbb{R}^m,$$

with  $a(x) = [a_{ij}(x)]$   $m \times m$  symmetric matrix.



# Possible extensions



- ▶ Study functionals depending also on  $u$ ;

# Possible extensions



- ▶ Study functionals depending also on  $u$ ;
- ▶ Study what happens if  $p \in \{1, \infty\}$

# A $H$ -compactness problem

Let  $X$  be defined on a bounded open neighbourhood  $\Omega_0$  of  $\Omega$ , let  $H_{X,0}^1(\Omega)$  be  $W_{X,0}^{1,2}(\Omega)$  and let  $H_X^{-1}(\Omega)$  denote the dual space of  $H_{X,0}^1(\Omega)$ . Moreover, let

$$X_j^T \varphi := - \sum_{i=1}^n \partial_{x_i} (c_{j,i} \varphi) = - (\operatorname{div}(X_j) + X_j) \varphi \quad \forall \varphi \in C_c^\infty(\Omega)$$

denote the (formal) adjoint of  $X_j$  in  $L^2(\Omega)$ , and  $a(x) := [a_{ij}(x)]$  be a matrix in  $J_2(\Omega, c_0, c_1)$ , such that  $c_0 |\eta|^2 \leq \langle a(x) \eta, \eta \rangle \leq c_1 |\eta|^2$  a.e.  $x \in \Omega$  for all  $\eta \in \mathbb{R}^m$ .

# A $H$ -compactness problem

Let  $X$  be defined on a bounded open neighbourhood  $\Omega_0$  of  $\Omega$ , let  $H_{X,0}^1(\Omega)$  be  $W_{X,0}^{1,2}(\Omega)$  and let  $H_X^{-1}(\Omega)$  denote the dual space of  $H_{X,0}^1(\Omega)$ . Moreover, let

$$X_j^T \varphi := - \sum_{i=1}^n \partial_{x_i} (c_{j,i} \varphi) = - (\operatorname{div}(X_j) + X_j) \varphi \quad \forall \varphi \in C_c^\infty(\Omega)$$

denote the (formal) adjoint of  $X_j$  in  $L^2(\Omega)$ , and  $a(x) := [a_{ij}(x)]$  be a matrix in  $J_2(\Omega, c_0, c_1)$ , such that  $c_0 |\eta|^2 \leq \langle a(x)\eta, \eta \rangle \leq c_1 |\eta|^2$  a.e.  $x \in \Omega$  for all  $\eta \in \mathbb{R}^m$ .

## Question

Can we infer a  $H$ -compactness result for the class  $\mathcal{E}(\Omega, c_0, c_1)$ , of linear partial differential operators in  $X$ -divergence form

$$\mathcal{L} = \operatorname{div}_X(a(x)X) := \sum_{j,i=1} X_j^T (a_{ij}(x)X_i),$$

whose domain  $D(\mathcal{L})$  is the set of functions  $u \in W_X^{1,2}(\Omega)$  such that the distribution defined by the right hand side belongs to  $L^2(\Omega)$ ?

Let  $\Omega$  be a bounded open set and let  $X$  be defined and Lipschitz continuous in a neighbourhood  $\Omega_0$  of  $\bar{\Omega}$ , satisfying (LIC) and such that:

- (H1) Let  $d : \mathbb{R}^n \times \mathbb{R}^n \rightarrow [0, \infty]$  be the so-called Carnot-Carathéodory distance function induced by  $X$ . We assume  $d(x, y) < \infty$  for any  $x, y \in \Omega_0$ , so that  $d$  is a standard distance in  $\Omega_0$ . Moreover, the distance  $d$  is continuous with respect to the usual topology of  $\mathbb{R}^n$ .
- (H2) For any compact  $K \subset \Omega_0$  and for any  $r < r_K$  and any  $x \in K$  there exists a constant  $C_K > 0$  such that  $|B_d(x, 2r)| \leq C_K |B_d(x, r)|$  where  $B_d(x, r)$  is the (open) metric ball with respect to  $d$ .

**A. Sánchez-Calle**, *Fundamental solutions and geometry of the sum of squares of vector fields*, *Invent. Math.* **78** (1) (1985), 103–147

**A. Nagel, E. M. Stein, S. Wainger**, *Balls and metrics defined by vector fields I: basic properties*, *Acta Math.* **155** (1984), 143–160

**N. Garofalo, DM. Nhieu**, *Isoperimetric and Sobolev inequalities for Carnot-Carathéodory spaces and the existence of minimal surfaces*, *Comm. on Pure and Applied Mathematics* **49** **10** (1996), 1081–1144

(H3) There exist geometric constants  $c, C > 0$  such that for any  $B = B_d(\bar{x}, r)$  with  $cB := B_d(\bar{x}, cr) \subseteq \Omega_0$ , for any  $f \in \text{Lip}(\overline{cB})$  and  $x \in \bar{B}$

$$\left| f(x) - \frac{1}{|B|} \int_B f(y) dy \right| \leq C \int_{cB} |Xf(y)| \frac{d(x, y)}{|B_d(x, d(x, y))|} dy.$$

**B. Franchi, E. Lanconelli**, *Hölder regularity theorem for a class of linear nonuniformly elliptic operators with measurable coefficients*, Ann. Scuola Norm. Sup. Pisa **10** (4) (1983), 523–541

**B. Franchi, C.E. Gutiérrez, R.L. Wheeden**, *Weighted Sobolev-Poincaré inequalities for Grushin type operators*, Comm. Partial Differential Equations **19** (3–4) (1994), 523–604

**B. Franchi, G. Lu, R. L. Wheeden**, *Representation formulas and weighted Poincaré inequalities for Hörmander vector fields*, Ann. Inst. Fourier, Grenoble **452** (1995), 577–604

**B. Franchi, R. Serapioni, F. Serra Cassano**, *Approximation and Imbedding Theorems for Weighted Sobolev Spaces Associated with Lipschitz Continuous Vector Fields*, Bolletino U.M.I., **11-B** (1997), 83–117

## Theorem (Franchi-Serapioni-Serra Cassano, 1997)

Let  $\Omega$  and  $\Omega_0$  be respectively a bounded open and an open set with  $\bar{\Omega} \subset \Omega_0$ , let  $1 \leq p < \infty$  and  $X = (X_1, \dots, X_m)$  be a family of Lipschitz continuous vector fields defined in  $\Omega_0$ . If  $X$  satisfies conditions (H1), (H2) and (H3), then for each metric ball  $B = B_d(x, r) \subset \Omega$  and  $u \in W_X^{1,p}(\Omega)$  there exist constants  $c(u, B) \in \mathbb{R}$  and  $C \in \mathbb{R}$

$$\int_B |u(x) - c(u, B)|^p dx \leq C r^p \int_B |Xu|^p dx \quad \forall u \in W_X^{1,p}(\Omega),$$

where the constant  $C$  is independent of  $u$ .

## Theorem (Franchi-Serapioni-Serra Cassano, 1997)

Let  $\Omega \Subset \Omega_0$  be a bounded open set,  $1 \leq p < \infty$  and  $X = (X_1, \dots, X_m)$  be a family of Lipschitz continuous vector fields defined in  $\Omega_0$ . If  $X$  satisfies conditions (H1), (H2) and (H3), then  $W_{X,0}^{1,p}(\Omega)$  is **compactly embedded** in  $L^p(\Omega)$ .

## Theorem

Let  $\Omega \Subset \Omega_0$  be open, bounded and connected,  $1 \leq p < \infty$  and let  $X = (X_1, \dots, X_m)$  be a family of Lipschitz continuous vector fields defined in  $\Omega_0$  such that  $X$  satisfies conditions (H1), (H2) and (H3). Then, there exists a positive constant  $c_{p,\Omega} > 0$  such that

$$\int_{\Omega} |u|^p dx \leq c_{p,\Omega} \int_{\Omega} |Xu|^p dx \text{ for each } u \in W_{X,0}^{1,p}(\Omega).$$

## Corollary

Let  $p$ ,  $\Omega$  and  $X$  as above. Then the function

$$\|u\|_{W_{X,0}^{1,p}} := \left( \int_{\Omega} |Xu|^p dx \right)^{\frac{1}{p}}$$

is a norm in  $W_{X,0}^{1,p}(\Omega)$  equivalent to  $\|\cdot\|_{W_X^{1,p}(\Omega)}$ .



# The $H$ -compactness result

## Theorem (Maione-P.-Serra Cassano, 2019)

Let  $\Omega$  and  $\Omega_0$  be respectively a bounded open and an open set with  $\bar{\Omega} \subset \Omega_0$  and let  $X$  be defined in  $\Omega_0$  satisfying conditions (H1), (H2), (H3), (LIC) on  $\Omega$ . Let  $a_h(x) = [a_{h,ij}(x)] \in \mathcal{J}_2(\Omega, c_0, c_1)$  and let  $(\mathcal{L}_h)_h$  be the associate operators in  $\mathcal{E}(\Omega, c_0, c_1)$ . Then, up to a subsequence, there exists an operator  $\mathcal{L} := \operatorname{div}_X(a(x)X) \in \mathcal{E}(\Omega, c_0, c_1)$ , such that, for all  $g \in L^2(\Omega)$  and  $\mu \geq 0$ , if  $(u_h)_h$  and  $u$  denote, respectively, the (unique) solutions of

$$\begin{cases} \mu v + \mathcal{L}_h(v) = g \text{ in } \Omega \\ v \in H_{X,0}^1(\Omega) \end{cases} \quad \text{and} \quad \begin{cases} \mu v + \mathcal{L}(v) = g \text{ in } \Omega \\ v \in H_{X,0}^1(\Omega) \end{cases}$$

then, as  $h \rightarrow \infty$

- ▶  $u_h \rightarrow u$  in  $L^2(\Omega)$ ;
- ▶  $a_h X u_h \rightarrow a X u$  weakly in  $L^2(\Omega)^m$ .

**A. Maione, P., F. Serra Cassano**,  $\Gamma$ -convergence for functionals depending on vector fields II. Convergence of minimizers and  $H$ -convergence, forthcoming

- ▶ In this general framework it is not possible to apply classic  $H$ -compactness techniques, because no definition of a  $\text{curl}$  is given (and even possible!).

► In this general framework it is not possible to apply classic  $H$ -compactness techniques, because no definition of a curl is given (and even possible!).

**Rmk.** An appropriate definition of curl, as well as a generalization of the Div-Curl lemma, have been given in the context of **Carnot groups** in the following paper:

**A. Baldi, B. Franchi, N. Tchou, M.C. Tesi**, *Compensated compactness for differential forms in Carnot groups*, Adv. in Math. (2010), 1555–1607

- ▶ In this general framework it is not possible to apply classic  $H$ -compactness techniques, because no definition of a curl is given (and even possible!).

**Rmk.** An appropriate definition of curl, as well as a generalization of the Div-Curl lemma, have been given in the context of **Carnot groups** in the following paper:

**A. Baldi, B. Franchi, N. Tchou, M.C. Tesi**, *Compensated compactness for differential forms in Carnot groups*, Adv. in Math. (2010), 1555–1607

- ▶ The techniques adopted here are an adaptation, to the symmetric case, of the ones of:

**N. Ansini, G. Dal Maso, C. I. Zeppieri**,  *$\Gamma$ -convergence and  $H$ -convergence of linear elliptic operators*, Journal de Mathématiques Pures et Appliquées. Neuvième Série, 99 (3), (2013), 321–329

# Sketch of the proof



Let us prove that, up to a subsequence, there exists an operator  $\mathcal{L} = \operatorname{div}_X(a(x)X) \in \mathcal{E}(\Omega)$  for which the convergence of the solutions holds. Let  $(a_h) \subset \mathcal{J}_1(\Omega, c_0, c_1)$  be the sequence of matrices associated to  $(\mathcal{L}_h)$  and let  $F_h : L^2(\Omega) \times \mathcal{A} \rightarrow [0, \infty]$  be the quadratic functionals defined by

$$F_h(u, A) := \begin{cases} \frac{1}{2} \int_A \langle a_h(x)Xu(x), Xu(x) \rangle dx & \text{if } A \in \mathcal{A}, u \in W_X^{1,2}(A) \\ \infty & \text{otherwise} \end{cases} .$$

By our compactness theorem, there exist a subsequence  $(F_{h_k})$  of  $(F_h)$  and  $a = (a_{ij}) \in \mathcal{J}_1(\Omega, c_0, c_1)$  such that  $(F_{h_k}(\cdot, \Omega))$   $\Gamma$ -converges in  $L^2(\Omega)$  to

$$F(u, \Omega) := \begin{cases} \frac{1}{2} \int_{\Omega} \langle a(x)Xu(x), Xu(x) \rangle dx & \text{if } u \in W_X^{1,2}(\Omega) \\ \infty & \text{otherwise} \end{cases} .$$

Let  $\mathcal{L}$  be the operator associated to  $F^0 : L^2(\Omega) \rightarrow [0, \infty]$

$$F^0(u) = \begin{cases} \frac{1}{2} \int_{\Omega} \langle a(x)Xu(x), Xu(x) \rangle dx & \text{if } u \in H_{X,0}^1(\Omega) \\ \infty & \text{otherwise} \end{cases} .$$

Let us consider the sequence of functionals  $F_h^0 : L^2(\Omega) \rightarrow [0, \infty]$  defined by

$$F_h^0(u) = \begin{cases} \frac{1}{2} \int_{\Omega} \langle a_h(x)Xu(x), Xu(x) \rangle dx & \text{if } u \in H_{X,0}^1(\Omega) \\ \infty & \text{otherwise} \end{cases}$$

whose associated operators are the functionals  $\mathcal{L}_h$ . It is possible to prove that

$$(F_h^0)_h \text{ } \Gamma\text{-converges to } F^0 \text{ in } L^2(\Omega) .$$

Let  $\mu \geq 0$  and  $g \in L^2(\Omega)$ , we denote by  $G : L^2(\Omega) \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$  the functional

$$G(u) := \int_{\Omega} \left( \frac{\mu}{2} u^2 - gu \right) dx.$$

Since  $G$  is (strongly) continuous in  $L^2(\Omega)$ , it follows that

$$(F_h^0 + G)_h \text{ } \Gamma\text{-converges to } F^0 + G \text{ in } L^2(\Omega).$$

It is easy to prove that for any  $h \in \mathbb{N}$  the functions  $u_h$  and  $u$  are the unique elements of the sets

$$\operatorname{argmin} \left\{ F_h^0(u) + G(u) \mid u \in H_{X,0}^1(\Omega) \right\}$$

and

$$\operatorname{argmin} \left\{ F^0(u) + G(u) \mid u \in H_{X,0}^1(\Omega) \right\}$$

respectively. The Poincaré inequality and the compact immersion gives that  $(F_h^0 + G)$  is equicoercive in  $H_{X,0}^1(\Omega)$  which gives the thesis.



To prove the convergence of the momenta we proved the following:

## Theorem (Convergence of momenta)

Let  $(f_h)_h \subset I_{m,p}(c_0, c_1, a_0, a_1)$  and let  $F_h : L^p(\Omega) \rightarrow [0, \infty]$ ,  $\mathcal{F}_h : L^p(\Omega)^m \rightarrow [0, \infty]$  be the sequence of functionals defined by

$$F_h(u) = F_h(u, \Omega) := \begin{cases} \int_{\Omega} f_h(x, Xu(x)) dx & \text{if } u \in W_x^{1,p}(\Omega) \\ \infty & \text{otherwise} \end{cases},$$

$$\mathcal{F}_h(\Phi) := \int_{\Omega} f_h(x, \Phi(x)) dx,$$

respectively.

Assume that:

(i)  $f_h(x, \cdot) : \mathbb{R}^m \rightarrow [0, \infty)$  belongs to  $C^1(\mathbb{R}^m)$ , for each  $h$ , for a.e.  $x \in \Omega$  and there exist  $c_2 > 0$ ,  $0 < \alpha < \min\{1, p - 1\}$  and a non negative function  $a_3 \in L^p(\Omega)$  such that

$$|\partial_\eta f_h(x, \eta_1) - \partial_\eta f_h(x, \eta_2)| \leq c_2 |\eta_1 - \eta_2|^\alpha (|\eta| + a_3(x))^{p-1}$$

for a.e.  $x \in \Omega$ , for each  $h$ ;

(ii) there exists  $F = \Gamma(L^p(\Omega)) - \lim_{h \rightarrow \infty} F_h$ , with

$$F(u) = F(u, \Omega) := \begin{cases} \int_{\Omega} f(x, Xu(x)) dx & \text{if } u \in W_x^{1,p}(\Omega) \\ \infty & \text{otherwise} \end{cases},$$

and  $f(x, \cdot) : \mathbb{R}^m \rightarrow [0, \infty)$  belongs to  $C^1(\mathbb{R}^m)$  for a.e.  $x \in \Omega$ ;

(iii) there exist a sequence  $(u_h)_h$  and a function  $u$  in  $W_X^{1,p}(\Omega)$  such that

$$u_h \rightarrow u \text{ in } L^p(\Omega) \text{ and } \mathcal{F}_h(Xu_h) \rightarrow \mathcal{F}(Xu), \text{ as } h \rightarrow \infty,$$

where  $\mathcal{F}(\Phi) := \int_{\Omega} f(x, \Phi(x)) dx$ , if  $\Phi \in L^p(\Omega)^m$ .

Then

$$\partial_{\Phi} \mathcal{F}_h(Xu_h) \rightarrow \partial_{\Phi} \mathcal{F}(Xu) \text{ weakly in } L^{p'}(\Omega)^m, \text{ as } h \rightarrow \infty.$$

where

$$\partial_{\Phi} \mathcal{F} : L^p(\Omega)^m \rightarrow L^{p'}(\Omega)^m$$

is given by

$$\partial_{\Phi} \mathcal{F}(\Phi) = \partial_{\eta} f(x, \Phi)$$

To prove the convergence of the momenta in our case it suffices to apply the previous theorem with

$$f_h(x, \eta) := \langle a_h(x)\eta, \eta \rangle \text{ and } f(x, \eta) := \langle a(x)\eta, \eta \rangle,$$

if  $x \in \Omega$ ,  $\eta \in \mathbb{R}^m$ . In this case

$$\partial_\Phi \mathcal{F}_h(Xu_h) = a_h Xu_h \text{ and } \partial_\Phi \mathcal{F}(Xu) = a Xu.$$

**Thank you**